Button Gwinnett & Lachlan McIntosh - Dueling in Savannah

Wayne Lynch

For the first year after the Declaration of Independence, the feud between Gov. Button Gwinnett and Gen. Lachlan McIntosh dominated the political scene in the new state of Georgia. While Gwinnett is most known for his role as a signer of the Declaration of Independence, a detailed look into the story demonstrates an almost overwhelming ambition for military command. Because both Gwinnett and McIntosh were loyal Whigs, the story displays a true tragedy where none should have existed.

Button Gwinnett

Born around 1732 and raised in a rural village near Gloucestershire, Button Gwinnett was the son of the Rev. Samuel Gwinnett of the Church of St. Mary and Corpus Christi. The boy received “as good an education as their moderate circumstances would allow” and grew up to become a grocer. As a young man, Button married Anne Bourne who bore him three children, two of whom died young while only his daughter, Elizabeth, lived to adulthood. The couple experienced financial difficulties while in Bristol and decided to immigrate to Georgia in 1762. Their timing was perfect for a man with a passion for politics. They arrived just before the Stamp Act crisis brought political upheaval to the colonies.¹

Gwinnett began life in the colonies as a Georgia merchant. Within a few years, he was well established and obtained a mortgage to purchase a plantation on St. Catherine’s Island near Sunbury, Ga. During his time on the island, Gwinnett participated actively in community affairs, serving first as a justice of the peace and later as an assemblyman. Unfortunately, financial success did not follow and Gwinnett soon found himself with debts greater than the value of his holdings. He came out of bankruptcy in 1773 still owing £1,000.²

Perhaps looking for distraction from his financial difficulties, Gwinnett befriended Dr. Lyman Hall who was a leader among the Sons of Liberty and Georgia’s delegate (though he did not attend) to the First Continental Congress. Displaying passion and talent, Gwinnett soon became even more active in Georgia politics. At that time, the voting laws had been written to favor the plantation owners and merchants centered near Savannah. Known as the conservative Whigs, that group resisted changes to governance at the colony (and later state) level even though they had joined the Revolution.

Portrait of Button Gwinnett, Signer of the Declaration of Independence from Georgia. Nathaniel Hone
In order to counter the power of the conservatives, Gwinnett organized a party of radical Whigs from rural Georgia whose primary political goal was to extend voting rights to more people and challenge the established planters. This “Popular Party” grew to prominence along with Whig sentiment in general until the January election in 1776 when Archibald Bulloch was elected President of the Assembly and Commander in Chief of Georgia. Button Gwinnett was chosen to serve as one of the state’s representatives to the 2nd Continental Congress and also as commander of the Georgia battalion of Continentals.3

Gwinnett’s appointment caused a great deal of unrest among the existing officers in the battalion. They started to resign in protest that Col. Samuel Elbert had been passed over for the position in favor of a man without any military experience. The argument grew heated and a compromise developed whereby a third man, Lachlan McIntosh, would become commander of the battalion. To soothe his pride and maintain peace, Gwinnett retained his position as one of the representatives from Georgia in the upcoming 2nd Continental Congress.4

As one of the five Georgia delegates, Gwinnett turned his attention north to Philadelphia and the business of Congress. He served on several committees including the Marine Committee, a Special Committee for northern operations, and the Committee studying the form for the Articles of Confederation. Historians disagree on Gwinnett’s level of participation in the debate on independence but there is no conflict on which direction he leaned. Gwinnett strongly favored independence for the colonies. In fact, his friend and fellow signer, Dr. Lyman Hall considered Gwinnett a “Whig to excess.”5

Near the end of Gwinnett’s term as representative, the Declaration of Independence was signed. He returned to Georgia expecting a hero’s welcome with big celebrations and popularity. His timing could not have been better. The defeat of Adm. Sir Peter Parker’s squadron at Charleston in June and the expulsion of Georgia’s last Royal governor, Sir James Wright, had reduced the number of Tories in Georgia as to be “hardly worth our notice unless it is with pity and contempt.”6 Gwinnett was elected Speaker of the Assembly and his influence at the state level seemed stronger than ever, but one item remained. Gwinnett still yearned for military command. The Continental battalion from Georgia was expanding to a full brigade and a general’s commission seemed within reach.

Unfortunately for Speaker Gwinnett, the decision on who to give the promotion to resided in the Continental Congress where Henry Laurens of South Carolina and other friends of Lachlan McIntosh favored the Scot from Darien.7 In October 1776, much to Gwinnett’s chagrin, he learned that McIntosh had been promoted to brigadier general of the Continental Brigade from Georgia.8

**The McIntosh Brothers**

The John McIntosh family first arrived to settle in Darien in the 1730s as part of Georgia founder James Oglethorpe’s plan to put a Scottish settlement along the Altamaha River. Oglethorpe hoped the Scots could guard the southern border of his new colony. Capt. John McIntosh’s older sons, William, Lachlan, and Lewis, had been born in Scotland but their youngest boy, George, was born during the year of immigration. Tragedy struck the family early on as an alligator snatched Lewis into the swamp never to be heard from again.

After three successful years in the colony in which Capt. McIntosh established himself as a leader in the community as well as a military commander, the War of Jenkins’ Ear broke out with Spain in 1739 and Gov. Oglethorpe developed a plan to attack St. Augustine in Spanish Florida. The invasion resulted in disaster as half the Scots were killed and many others, including Capt. John McIntosh, were captured and held prisoner by the Spanish.9

Having lost over half the settlement’s manpower, the town of Darien fell on hard times. The oldest
McIntosh brother – William – was of age and fought with Oglethorpe. He remained with the army and fought at Bloody Marsh, the 1742 British victory over the Spanish on St. Simons Island, Ga. With no husband to help protect her young family, Capt. John McIntosh’s wife – Katherine M. McIntosh – moved to South Carolina and lived at Fort Palachacola on the Savannah River with her youngest children while Lachlan and his sister, Anne, went to the Bethesda orphanage started by George Whitefield about ten miles south of Savannah. The family reunited in Darien a couple of years later when the danger of Spanish invasion subsided. Lachlan joined the army during the last months of the war but did not fight in any battles. The Spanish eventually released Capt. McIntosh at some point prior to 1748. He returned to his family and the community of Darien but his power and political influence had long passed to others during his long absence.10

Recession hit the colony in 1748 sending Lachlan and George to Charlestown where Lachlan found work as a counting clerk for Henry Laurens. The two men formed a bond of friendship that included business partnerships and continued when the McIntosh brothers returned to Darien a few years later. By this time Lachlan was considered extremely handsome and married Sarah Threadcraft. The couple had children and began accumulating slaves before obtaining Georgia “headrights” of 100 acres for Lachlan and 50 acres for each member of the household. Because slaves were considered members of the household and the headrights came with an option to purchase 1,000 acres more, Lachlan soon produced rice at a very substantial plantation along the Altamaha River. He became the overall leader of the McIntosh family and used his influence to get his younger brother, George, a job as commissary of supplies for Fort Frederica on St. Simons Island.11

All three of the McIntosh brothers obtained rice plantations and became wealthy men of high standing during the decade prior to the Revolution. Lachlan and William remained active with the militia and local affairs while George represented their district in the colony’s Commons House. George married Ann Priscilla Houstoun whose family was also extremely influential in Georgia even though some of them were later Loyalists.

The McIntosh clan again dominated political life in St. Andrews Parish. When the Darien Committee formed in January of 1775, Lachlan was chosen as its leader. Following along with recent elections heavily favoring Whig candidates, the committee promptly voted to “acquieze & Join in all the Resolutions passed by the Grand American Congress in Philadelphia last October. We thank them for their sage council and advice,” the committee wrote, “and most heartily and cheerfully accede to the Association entered into by them.”12

Lachlan’s work on the Darien Committee continued into the summer. Although a known Whig, he remained mostly clear of politics beyond the local level. Early in 1776, a dispute broke out between the conservative Whigs and the radical Whigs over the appointment of Button Gwinnett as colonel of the new Georgia Regiment of the Continental Army. The conservatives objected loudly when Gwinnett was chosen as a representative to the Continental Congress. They argued that Gwinnett could not hold a position in both the military and the Congress but, in reality, they were pushing back against the political inroads made by the radical wing of the Whig Party in Georgia. Lacking enough confidence to proceed without the powerful conservative Whigs from Savannah, the radicals felt “obliged to compromise” and agreed to the appointment of Lachlan McIntosh as colonel and Samuel Elbert as lieutenant colonel of the new regiment.13

Col. Lachlan McIntosh proved capable of the command early on when British ships appeared in the river below Savannah. In charge of the colony’s only regiment, Col. McIntosh reacted by assuming command of the area and positioning his men along the river to defend against an assault. The British spent a few days on the river trying to raid Savannah of some rice boats at the port but were eventually convinced to leave when McIntosh released fire ships to sail downriver and collide with them. On their way back to Florida, the British ships carried Georgia’s last Royal Gov. Sir James Wright and a fair amount of the rice which had been offloaded into their holds, but the Whigs felt successful nonetheless.14
Summer brought news of a British squadron under Adm. Sir Peter Parker that threatened the southern colonies. Once the British ships appeared off the coast of South Carolina, Col. McIntosh moved north to help Continental Gen. John Armstrong and SC Gov. John Rutledge defend Charlestown. With a bit of help from British miscalculation of water depth and the ability of sand and palmetto log revetments to absorb cannon balls, the Patriots defeated Parker and secured Charlestown for the foreseeable future. By early July, McIntosh had returned to Georgia as a success. During this time period, McIntosh maintained personal contact with Button Gwinnett and provided the Congressman with news from home and family. There was no indication yet of a problem in the relationship between Gwinnett and McIntosh – both men were not from Savannah and had commercial interests.

Georgia responded to the attacks by calling up the backcountry militia under Col. Samuel Jack so they could join the South Carolina militia column of Maj. Andrew Williamson of the Ninety Six District. That column moved against the Cherokee while Col. McIntosh took his regiment (and more militia) into the southern parishes for a similar move against the plundering Loyalists of East Florida. While Williamson destroyed the villages and burned the crops in Cherokee country, Col. McIntosh “retaliated on the miserable colony of East Florida. Every settlement to the northward of St. John’s River is broken up, particularly Lord Egmont’s and the planters thrown in the greatest distress.” McIntosh even managed to capture two brothers of Georgia’s Royal Gov., Sir James Wright.

The 1st Expedition Against British East Florida
September - December 1776

After rolling back the frontier to a point below the St. John’s River in East Florida, Col. McIntosh returned to Savannah just before the end of August. At that time the new commander of the southern Continental Army, Gen. Charles Lee, had arrived with news that Congress had declared independence. Celebrations broke out and, when combined with all the recent military success, the Declaration of Independence created a sense of confidence in the Whigs that bordered on delusions of invincibility. The hysteria infected almost all the Georgia Whigs regardless of party affiliation and they quickly devised an ambitious plan to invade East Florida and drive the British out of that colony. Unfortunately, newly arrived Gen. Lee did not buy into the hype. When he pointed to the lack of supplies and preparation, the Georgians simply assured him that all the plunder in St. Augustine would take care of feeding the army. Always outspoken and difficult to get along with, Charles Lee argued hard with the Georgians even to the point of losing his command to their loud complaints. His response had a strange and
foreboding sense of truth behind it when he suggested the Georgians were so ridiculous that he “should not be surprised if they were to propose mounting a body of mermaids upon alligators” in the attack on East Florida.\(^\text{19}\)

Though reluctant to get behind the Florida invasion, Gen. Lee sent to South Carolina for troops. In light of the still ongoing Cherokee Campaign, the government there showed little enthusiasm for the invasion and managed to arrange for the 8\(^{\text{th}}\) Virginia Regiment, under Col. Peter Muhlenberg, to come down and fill out the ranks necessary for a campaign into Florida. While gathering support elsewhere, Lee instructed the Georgians to purchase necessary supplies for the endeavor by providing a list to the government. Headed by Button Gwinnett, the Assembly failed to make any significant arrangements for delivery of supplies to the designated starting point along the Altamaha River. Instead, they argued with Lee and harassed the Continental Congress into recalling the general and sending a replacement. Lee returned to Charlestown and the northern theater within two days of the recall which “put an end to the East-Florida expedition.”\(^\text{20}\)

While the politicians argued with the general, Muhlenberg’s Virginia regiment “suffered exceedingly by sickness” with many deaths at Sunbury, Ga., the assembly place, and had to be transferred to the coastal islands for recovery. By mid-September, the regiment only reported 12 men fit for duty and were given permission to return to their home state.\(^\text{21}\)

Dispute

The Continental regiment from Georgia needed to be reorganized. Many of the enlistments were expiring and the state faced a constant shortage of men to guard the frontier. Button Gwinnett let it be known that he wanted the job and the politics of Georgia landed in the lap of Congress where Gwinnett felt his personal service and connections should be sufficient to get the commission. Even though Joseph Clay later reported the decision as “a compromise between parties in the convention,” the truth was that friends of Col. McIntosh, Henry Laurens and George Walton entered the discussion. They used their very considerable influence to promote Lachlan instead of handing the commission to Gwinnett as a political reward.\(^\text{22}\)

With a larger command, Lachlan McIntosh jumped into his new duties with enthusiasm. While sending his brother William on a series of patrols south of the Altamaha, McIntosh ignored the politicians who continued pushing for an invasion of East Florida. Instead, McIntosh concentrated on a detailed plan of defense for the state.\(^\text{23}\) McIntosh’s plan included abandoning defense of the coastal islands and bringing all the livestock deeper into the state. This detail made the plan very unpopular among Gwinnett and his supporters in the lower counties. Many of them relied on the island plantations for grazing and rice production. McIntosh also ordered construction of a new fort along the Altamaha River on Beard’s Bluff [north of modern Jessup, Ga.] to be maintained by a company of infantry while serving as a ranger base for continuing patrols south of the river.

October 1776 brought rumors of a possible attack by the Creeks. A scout named Tom Gray “returned from the Indian Country” at high speed with a report that John Stuart, British Superintendent of the Southern Indian Department, and all his agents were meeting in Pensacola “to determine upon a general war that 500 of the Creeks upon Floriday neck are already engaged.” The British were trying to take pressure off the Cherokee whose situation looked grim due to Virginia’s Col. William Christian’s, North Carolina’s Gen. Griffith Rutherford’s and South Carolina’s Col. Andrew Williamson’s concerted ongoing campaigns into their primary settlements. William McIntosh confirmed Gray’s report by running into a party of raiders coming north into southern Georgia who expected support from a large war party nearby “which is very alarming to this State in its present defenceless Situation.”\(^\text{24}\)

Now a lieutenant colonel, William McIntosh tried to maintain a strong defense for the southern counties. Unfortunately, the border was long and only two troops of mounted men patrolled the entire length. In early November newly promoted Gen. Lachlan McIntosh visited the forts to the south. While he waited to meet with Maj. Leonard Marbury at a rendezvous point, a former Georgian turned Loyalist
renegade named William Oldis “came in an armed Schooner with 60 men & burnt a settlement upon Frederica Island” before escaping to East Florida.\textsuperscript{25} Within a few days, demands upon himself and his men had nearly worn out the general. Lachlan reported being “tired with repeated” complaints about the lack of protection provided by his patrols along the southern frontier.\textsuperscript{26}

Lachlan’s headaches continued through November with reports of Indian depredations when a new problem arose. Button Gwinnett had not taken his rejection for the post of brigadier general quietly. Instead, he started investigations into conduct by the McIntosh brothers in hopes of forcing Lachlan out of the position. Despite his best efforts, Button Gwinnett failed to dig up any dirt on Lachlan. As a result, he was now using the southern troubles and his position as head of the assembly to investigate William McIntosh for shirking his duty along the frontier. No doubt Lachlan found the whole business frustrating that fellow Georgians would “throw every possible Discouragement & Stumbling block in the way” of the army trying to do its job.\textsuperscript{27}

**Georgia Politics in 1777**

When the report from Tom Gray went public in early 1777 a general uproar overtook the state. Even the members of the Assembly adjourned for five weeks to see to their families. Unfortunately, in their haste to get home, the matter of approving and funding any plan of defense went neglected.\textsuperscript{28}

When the assembly finally reconvened in late November, Speaker Gwinnett had begun the investigation into the state of frontier defense. He instituted proceedings against Lt. Col. William McIntosh for negligence in failing to defend some plantations above the St. John’s River during the earlier aborted attempt at East Florida. The lieutenant colonel continued to lead his ranger troop for another month but, after the hearing at which he was exonerated, William indicated that he was “quite worn out with yr.[ye.?] hardships & fatigue of the service” and obtained a leave of absence from ranger duty for his health.\textsuperscript{29}

The timing of William’s departure from service could not have been worse. At the very end of December about 400 Indians invested the area around Fort McIntosh at Beard’s Bluff on the Altamaha. The attack caused panic in the 28-man garrison, over half of whom immediately deserted the area. Lt. William Bugg and another man escaped to Savannah where they arrived looking for relief for the men who remained at Fort McIntosh. Lachlan responded with a small troop of horse under Lt. Ignatius Few, whose orders were to relieve Fort McIntosh and wait for Capt. Chesley Bostick. When he arrived, Bostick “was astonished to find that post vacant” even though it represented an open door for “a great number of Indians” to come into the state and raid the settlements.\textsuperscript{30}

While the army struggled to defend the southern frontier, the people in South Carolina grew concerned over the state of affairs in Georgia. At the very time when unity needed to prevail, political parties in Georgia grew ever more partisan and nasty. Gen. Robert Howe, the new Continental Army commander in the Southern Department, complained to Speaker Gwinnett that Georgia lacked the population and resources to defend itself and the people had not prepared the state for war. Instead of taking proper care of business, the people of Georgia were all about private disputes and party politics. They did not even have a proper constitution nor strict laws for militia service. “It gives me Sir, great anxiety to find your State so destitute of almost every Military requisite,” Howe wrote, suggesting that if Gwinnett could just put aside his personal disputes he would see a “golden opportunity” to do something for the “good of the Common Cause”\textsuperscript{31}

The ‘good’ that Howe recommended to the Georgia Assembly came to speak with them in the person of William Henry Drayton who arrived in Savannah early in January 1777. Drayton brought a message from South Carolina. He spoke to the Assembly for over an hour on the 22\textsuperscript{nd} laying out arguments for a consolidation of Georgia and South Carolina into one state. He promised lower taxes, lower expense of government, elimination of boundary disputes between the states, higher land values, and a stronger currency. Drayton’s speech fell flat when Button Gwinnett responded with a lengthy speech in favor of Georgia remaining independent. Gwinnett included arguments based on the Articles of Confederation which Drayton pointed out had not
been ratified; nevertheless, Gwinnett’s speech fell on very sympathetic ears and Georgia remained separate from South Carolina.32

Later in January, the Assembly chose a “Committee of Seven” to “reconsider and revise the form of a Constitution” for the new and independent State of Georgia. Gwinnett headed the committee and they worked for two weeks before presenting a draft constitution for consideration by the delegates who then unanimously adopted the document on February 5, 1777.33 Among the provisions was a reorganization of the old parishes into a system of counties with more equal representation for the frontier areas above Augusta and along the Ogeechee River. Additionally, voting rights were extended to more citizens than in any other state, requiring only that a voter be a 21 year old white man with at least $10 worth of property. Gwinnett’s Popular Party was now in position to dominate politics in the state. The new Constitution would take effect in May 1777.

In early 1777 Lachlan’s other brother, George McIntosh, remained one of the few powerful members of the government not in favor with Gwinnett or the inner circle of men who ran the Popular Party. While Gwinnett and his friends referred to themselves as “The Liberty Society,” the old conservatives of Savannah saw them through different eyes. They classified Gwinnett’s group as a “Nocturnal Junto” whose “tyrannical proceedings” existed to “keep themselves a while in power to be a scourge and a curse to the honest part of the community.”34 Still holding a seat on the Executive Council of Safety of Georgia, George McIntosh owed his political position to those old Conservatives. He represented a thorn in the side of Button Gwinnett.

While the radical Liberty Party argued with the Conservatives, Georgia’s Pres. Archibald Bulloch represented a very rare commodity, a neutral party. Being neutral and therefore acceptable to both parties, Bulloch was trusted with a commission on February 22 granting him some extremely broad powers to govern the state during “every urgent occasion.”35 Unfortunately, Pres. Bulloch died the very next day. His death represented victory for the Liberty Party since the death left Gwinnett in control. On the 24th of February Gwinnett signed new commissions for militia officers as President of the Council of Safety. At least one doctor is known to have suspected that Bulloch had been poisoned, but there was no investigation into Bulloch’s death. His death left the Liberty Party with a majority on the Council of Safety and they immediately elected Gwinnett as the new president.

The Executive council met on March 4, 1777, to elect a new president and commander in chief of the militia. Of the six council members, only George McIntosh refused to vote for Gwinnett or to go along with granting him a commission of powers even greater than that previously granted to Bulloch.36 Having already witnessed Gwinnett’s accusations and attacks on his brother William, George McIntosh resolved not to sign the commission on the basis that he since had not been present on the 22nd when the council members granted the original extraordinary war powers to Bulloch, he therefore was not bound to sign Gwinnett’s commission.

Naturally the refusal to sign Gwinnett’s commission enraged the new President and he shot back to McIntosh: “this shall be the last time that you and I will meet in Council.”37

The Case of George McIntosh

Before Pres. Gwinnett had an opportunity to focus attention on the problem of George McIntosh, he had to face the situation of British, Indian and Loyalists incursions on the southern border. Even though Fort McIntosh at Beard’s Bluff on the Altamaha River had been reoccupied after it temporarily fell, British forces from East Florida had reentered the state and put the fort under siege. It fell a few days later when the garrison ran low on powder. Gen. Lachlan McIntosh responded to the loss with his Georgia Continentals along with assistance from some militia and the 6th South Carolina Regiment of Continentals under Col. Thomas Sumter. Together, they mustered enough troops to discourage the British from crossing the rivers to the north of Fort McIntosh.

Continental Gen. Robert Howe of North Carolina – now in command of the South Carolina and Georgia Continentals in the Southern Department – traveled
to Savannah to meet with Pres. Gwinnett and the Council of Safety in early March 1777. Unable to get a quorum for a meeting with the Council, Howe met privately with Pres. Gwinnett to discuss his plans for a 2nd expedition against British East Florida. The Council had already voted in favor of the proposal and given Gwinnett authority to lead the invasion. Unfortunately for Pres. Gwinnett, Gen. Howe remained of the opinion that an expedition against St. Augustine would require far more manpower and artillery than could possibly be made available. Gwinnett’s wife, Ann, would later accuse Howe of spending most of his time socializing with the Savannah Tories and paying little regard to Pres. Gwinnett’s requests.38

On the 8th of March, Button Gwinnett received a very timely and, for him, a most fortuitous communication from Pres. John Hancock of the Continental Congress. An eight-month-old letter from Gov. Patrick Tonyn of East Florida to Lord George Germain, Secretary of State for the American Department, accused George McIntosh of being a Tory and of breaking the law prohibiting trade with the British. Hancock said the letter contained “the most convincing proof of the reasonable conduct of Mr. George McIntosh of your State. This Gentleman it seems, is a Member of the Congress in Georgia, and under that character is secretly supporting, by every act in his power, the designs of the British King and Parliament against us.” Along with that strong indictment, Hancock instructed that “the said George McIntosh to be immediately apprehended” along with “every other step in this matter which shall appear to you to be necessary for the safety of the United States of America.”39

Hancock included the evidence against George McIntosh and it was indeed quite damning. Gov. Tonyn reported to Lord Germain that St. Augustine received a shipload of rice from a Mr. Panton who “executed this business with great hazard to his life and fortune.” He went on to say that Panton had “been greatly assisted by Mr. George McIntosh, who is compelled to a tacit acquiescence with the distempered times, and is one of the Rebel Congress of Georgia, intentionally to mollify and temporize, and to be of all the service in his power. I am informed his principles are a loyal attachment to the King and Constitution. He would, my Lord, be in a dangerous situation was this known.”40

According to the later account of George McIntosh to Congress, Pres. Bulloch had received the letter from John Hancock before he died but had chosen to ignore it due to his personal knowledge of George’s integrity and zeal for the cause.41 George McIntosh’s statement conflicts with a letter from Gwinnett to Hancock explaining his actions and claiming receipt of the letter on the 14th rather than the 8th. However, according to George McIntosh, he was arrested on the 8th and since Gwinnett sent a request to remove Lachlan McIntosh from command in Georgia on the 14th, it would appear that George McIntosh is correct as to the earlier date. Further, Gwinnett’s letter to Hancock indicates that, on the 14th, he “reconsidered Your Letter” and then took action. Quite possibly this was an admission that the letter actually had arrived prior to Pres. Bulloch’s death and was not considered particularly important until after Gwinnett had the political clash with George on March 4.42

Regardless of whether the letter’s arrival occurred on the 8th or there was simply a prior letter received and ignored by Bulloch, Pres. Gwinnett seized the moment to go after George McIntosh. He was nervous that some of the Council members favored McIntosh and might refuse the order to arrest him. Gwinnett acted quickly in order to bypass the council. He immediately “caused said George McIntosh to be taken Prisoner, & put in the common jail - & ordered him to have Iron handcufs on, for being a Traitor to the United States of America & this State in Particular-& directly sent one Colonel Sandiford, to Seize the Estate Real & Personal of said George McIntosh, the State Prisoner.”43

George McIntosh described the circumstances of his arrest vividly. Between his confrontation with Gwinnett and the time of his arrest on the 8th of March, George had become sick in bed, “afflicted with the Piles and unable to walk or sit.” In that condition, he “was surprised by an officer with a party of armed men, attending the Provost Marshall of Georgia, who entered his chamber and seized him.” The men insisted on “carrying him instantly
Not content with merely arresting George McIntosh, “President Gwinnett of his own authority and also without advice of councils had ordered his Estate to be Siezed, and accordingly his Negroes, crates of rice & corn, his cattle, and Plantation, utensils were taken into custody” by the men with the officer making the arrest. George accused the men of whipping his slaves “unmercifully” until they told of all the hidden liquor and supplies which lay “wasted, scattered, and much destroyed, although an inventory was pretended to be made.”*45 Gwinnett later explained his actions: “As his Crime was no less than treason against the United States, I thought I could not better express a detestation of it, than by ordering him in Irons.”*46

Once George McIntosh was secured in the jail, Gwinnett’s assumptions as to whether his fellow Council members would have arrested him proved correct. John Houstoun immediately started trying to arrange bail for George, who also happened to be his brother in law. Houstoun wanted to put up £50,000 as security for George’s release but Gwinnett refused and “wou’d by no means take any sort of Bail for Him.”*47

Luckily enough for George McIntosh, “the expedition soon calld Mr. Gwinnett from Savannah”, and the Vice President presided over the council. They met again and overruled Gwinnett regarding the terms of arrest for George who had become sick while languishing in the Savannah jail. John Houstoun and Vice President Jonathan Bryan (along with several others) signed George McIntosh’s £20,000 bond and arranged the return of his property. Mrs. Gwinnett later accused all the council members involved with Loyalism. She charged that “none but Tories wou’d Bail a State Prisoner, & one that had been in the Council too-but tis plain He only got in to betray it-really they are all so much alike they will all Bail one another, take any oath, do anything to put the Continental Money in their pocket.”*48

During the bail proceedings, George’s story came out. He had joined a venture for shipping rice to Dutch Guiana with his brother-in-law, Sir Patrick Houstoun, and a pair of known Tories, Robert Baillie and William Panton. Panton sailed to St. Augustine where he sold the rice cargo to Gov. Tonyn in violation of the Continental Congress’s non-exportation agreement. Tonyn noticed the opportunity to embarrass a prominent Georgia politician and named George McIntosh in his “captured” letter to Lord Germain. Tonyn’s intent to sow discord among the Whigs shows itself in the omission of Houstoun and Baillie from the letter as they were both well known to be Loyalists.*49 For his part, George McIntosh denied any knowledge of dealing with the British. In his words, George “never knew, expected, wished, or believed that the vessel in question would be carried to any other port than the one for which she was cleared, namely Surrinam.”*50

With his bail arranged, George McIntosh returned to his plantation to try and restore some order to the chaos created by his arrest and property seizure. The Council gave him the personal property they had available for return but George lost far more than his £200 share of rice sales to St. Augustine.

The 2nd Expedition Against British East Florida
April - June 1777

While the bail hearing and council activities continued, Pres. Gwinnett traveled south to Sunbury to take command of his expedition against British East Florida. Gwinnett realized he had a problem without cooperation from Gen. Robert Howe and the Southern Continental Army. As President of the Council of Safety, his authority would not extend beyond the Georgia militia and perhaps the Georgia Continental battalions, men commanded by Gen. Lachlan McIntosh. In light of his recent actions against George McIntosh, Gwinnett had little hope of cooperation from his rival. Because of his difficult situation, Gwinnett appealed to Gen. Howe for “the immediate removal of General McIntosh out of this State.” Gwinnett explained Lachlan’s close relationship to the allegedly treasonous George McIntosh and of “the danger that might accrue to this State from the warmth of private resentment.”*51 Gen. Howe barely “even noticed” the request. Instead, he explained his belief that the expedition required more manpower and should be
made in the winter. Howe then refused to participate and returned to South Carolina leaving Gen. Lachlan McIntosh as the senior Continental officer in Georgia.\(^{52}\)

Gwinnett would not allow the expedition to fail so easily and continued his effort to raise a sizable militia force. He also added a few ships to sail against St. Augustine. To his credit, Gwinnett managed to assemble 3 sloops and 4 galleys that carried various weapons. In addition, he had requested “the Randolph Frigate & the Hornet Sloop” from Charlestown.\(^{53}\) Unfortunately, Gwinnett’s attempts to raise a significant militia force did not go as well. Even though he described the force as “part of the Militia, who have assented to go,” Gen. McIntosh indicated a much smaller number. He said there were “few or no Militia to join them.”\(^{54}\)

While Gwinnett spent the rest of the month trying to raise militia, Gen. McIntosh had his own problems. The Continental Army remained isolated on the southern frontier and the general had only second-hand reports of the upcoming expedition. Pres. Gwinnett made no effort to contact him directly or to coordinate any actions. McIntosh’s situation was made even worse by low morale among his troops who were chronically unpaid with short enlistment terms. He reported “great discontent among a number of our first Battalion” who were deserting the army.\(^{55}\)

On the 28th, Pres. Gwinnett complained to the Continental Congress in Philadelphia about Howe’s lack of cooperation and his failure to remove Lachlan McIntosh from command over the Georgia Continentals. Concerning Gen. Howe, Gwinnett stated: “He came, He saw, and left us in our low Estate.” Instead of assisting the state’s effort to invade East Florida, it seemed that Howe was determined to “obstruct the attempt.”\(^{56}\)

McIntosh saw something different in Gwinnett’s complaints. He believed Gwinnett was looking for someone to blame for his failure. Since the President had failed to raise any significant militia force, he was looking for a “hole to creep out of & throw the blame upon the military if nothing was done.”\(^{57}\)

Two weeks later McIntosh was still waiting for Gwinnett to form a junction with him. However, instead of having the President arrive in camp, McIntosh found himself accused of “retarding” the campaign by failing to move the army to Sunbury where Gwinnett was waiting. McIntosh defended his behavior by insisting that his troops were “under Marching Orders & ready since you first applied to me for assistance.” They had been waiting for instructions from Gwinnett.\(^{58}\)

To get things going in the right direction, McIntosh sent orders for Col. Samuel Elbert to march his Georgia Continentals from Savannah to Sunbury for the junction with Gwinnett. The general followed two days later with his remaining Georgia Continentals. He arrived in the evening of April 14 at which time Pres. Gwinnett called for a council of war. Instead of attending Gwinnett’s council, Gen. McIntosh held his own officers’ meeting to discuss whether or not they considered it improper for the President to call a council of war. The other Continental officers supported McIntosh in refusing Gwinnett’s interference “with the particular province of the Officers of the Military.” They were specifically unimpressed with the low numbers of militia brought along with Gwinnett.\(^{59}\)

The pointless standoff between Gwinnett and McIntosh repeated itself the next day. The two men simply could not agree on proper leadership roles for the expedition to East Florida. They finally tried again late in the evening and managed an agreement by which “Seemingly all partys were Satisfied.” Unfortunately, Gwinnett’s friend and fellow councilman, Dr. Lyman Hall, arrived at Sunbury on the 16th. He stirred up trouble and “brought back the old contest of the right of calling Councils of Warr, when it was thought to be settled.” The officers were summoned to yet another meeting set for the following morning.\(^{60}\)

The stalemate over control of the Florida expedition heated back up and turned into a standoff between the Continental Army officers and the Council of Safety in Georgia. By April 19 four council members had arrived and passed resolutions requesting McIntosh step aside. They requested that Col. Elbert take control of the Georgia Continental battalions. Drawing the situation to a point of
ridiculousness, the Continental officers met and decided that the new resolutions were unlawful as an overreach of civilian authority. They also pounced on the lack of a quorum in the limited number of council members present. Thus armed with this argument, Gen. McIntosh “set off for Savannah in the Evening” of the 20th to request a hearing before the full Council.\(^{61}\)

While the Continental officers sent McIntosh to Savannah, the council members on site with the expedition came to a similar conclusion regarding Pres. Gwinnett. When McIntosh repeatedly refused to attend the councils of war called by Gwinnett, the council members joined with the militia officers present and advised Gwinnett to “return to this place (Savannah) & leave the command of the expedition to the next officer.” Now removed from the expedition, the personal dispute between McIntosh and Gwinnett then moved back to Savannah where McIntosh repeatedly tried to arrange a formal hearing on the question of whether President Gwinnett was overstepping his authority. Unfortunately for the general, the council deferred his hearing until a new Assembly convened in May. In the meantime, Gwinnett and the council tried to bypass McIntosh by sending instructions directly to Col. Elbert to take command of the expedition to East Florida.\(^{62}\)

**The Duel**

Pres. Gwinnett tried to move forward with the invasion of East Florida. He sent orders to the army but soon discovered Col. Elbert unwilling to move without first having positive orders from Gen. McIntosh. Elbert saw Gwinnett’s order as a breach in his chain of command and let the authorities of Georgia feel the limits of their power.\(^{63}\) Even with this support from his officers, McIntosh made no attempt to stand in the way of the expedition. He promptly sent orders for Col. Elbert to proceed with “the utmost of your power” to comply with the intentions of the council.\(^{64}\)

Instead of rejoining his expedition in the field, Pres. Gwinnett remained in Savannah to participate in the upcoming elections. When the Assembly met on May 8, Gwinnett started campaigning for the office of Governor of Georgia. Under the new constitution adopted in January, the governor would be the chief executive officer for the state. Unfortunately for Gwinnett, many of the people were tired of his struggles with the army. He faced a strong opponent from within his own party, John Adam Treutlen, who was elected by a large majority.\(^{65}\)

With the election behind them, the Assembly convened McIntosh’s requested hearing into the conduct of Pres. Gwinnett regarding relations with the military. Gen. McIntosh tried to convince the assembly that the expedition had been “formed to gratify the dangerous Ambition” of Gwinnett and predicted a bad end to the entire business. He complained of Gwinnett’s failure to properly consult with him or the military in any planning of the expedition, and declared that any accusations of noncooperation were simply lies and falsehoods.\(^ {66}\) In fact, McIntosh got so frustrated and angry at the meeting as to call Pres. Gwinnett “a Scoundrel and lying Rascal”.\(^ {67}\) Unimpressed with the general’s arguments and deeply concerned with civilian control over the military, the Assembly dismissed any notion of wrongdoing by Gwinnett and exonerated the former President.

Even though supported by the Assembly’s decision, Gwinnett remained stung by not winning the governorship and embarrassed by McIntosh’s public insult. He sent a challenge to McIntosh, preserved in an excellent account by one George Wells:

“That late on the Evening of Thursday, the 15th of May instant [1777], a written challenge was brought to Genl. McIntosh signed Button Gwinnett, wherein the said Mr. Gwinnett charg’d the General with calling him a Scoundrel in public Conversation, and desir’d he would give satisfaction for it as a Gentleman before Sunrise next morning in Sir James Wright’s pasture, behind Colo. Martin’s house; to which the General humorously sent in answer to Mr. Gwinnett, that the hour was rather earlier than his usual, but would assuredly meet him at the place and time appointed with a pair of pistols only, as agreed upon with Mr. Gwinnett’s second, who brought the challenge.

"Early the next morning Mr. Gwinnett and his second found the General and his Second
waiting on the Ground and after politely saluting each other the General drew his pistols to show he was loaded only with single Balls, but avoided entering into any other conversation but the business on hand. It was then propos’d and agreed to, that they shou’d go a little lower down the hill, as a number of spectators appear’d and when the Ground was chose the seconds ask’d the distance. Mr. Gwinnett reply’d ‘whatever distance the General pleases.’ the General said he believ’d Eight or ten feet would be sufficient, and they were immediately measur’d to which the General’s second desir’d another step might be added. It was then proposed to turn back to back. The General answer’d ‘By no means let us see what we are about’----& immediately each took his stand, and agreed to fire as they cou’d. both pistols went off nearly at the same time, when Mr. Gwinnett fell being shot above the knee, and said his thigh was broke. The General, who was also shot thro’ the thick of the Thigh, stood still in his place & not thinking his antagonist was worse wounded than himself----- as he immediately afterward declar’d---- ask’d if he had enough or was for another shot, to which all objected, and the seconds declar’d they both behav’d like Gentlemen and men of honor, Led the General up to Mr. Gwinnett and they both shook hands.\textsuperscript{68}

Another very interesting account worthy of inclusion comes from Gwinnett’s close friend and fellow signer of the Declaration of Independence, Lyman Hall:

“Here it was in Assembly that the General called him (as tis said) a Scoundrel & lying Rascal—I confess I did not hear the Words, not being so nigh the parties however it seems Agreed that it was so----a dual was the Consequence, in which they were placed at 10 or 12 foot Distance, Discharged their pistols nearly at the same Time----Each Wounded in the Thigh, Mr. Gwinnett’s, thigh broked so that he fell----on which (tis said) the General Asked him if he Chose to Take another Shot----was Answered, Yes, if they would help him up,----(or words nearly the same)----the Seconds Interposed----Mr. Gwinnett was brought in, the Weather, Extrem Hot--- a Mortification came on----he languished from that Morning (Friday) till Monday Morning following & Expired,----O Liberty! why do you suffer so many of your faithfull sons, your Warmest Votaries to fall at your Shrine! Alas my Friend! my Friend!”\textsuperscript{69}

Governor Treutlen takes Control

Once Gwinnett died, the colony devolved even further into warring political factions. This time the focus lay squarely on Gen. McIntosh and his brother as the parties could easily be identified as the McIntosh Party or the Gwinnett Party. In light of the duel and shifting political authority, the new assembly reopened their investigation in the case of George McIntosh. With Gwinnett’s death, the evidence became clear to the assembly. They found that George McIntosh “knew the destination of the Voyage was to be left entirely to the Junior Panton; now Mr. McIntosh, being a Member of our Council, must know the Character of these Men - that we had been warned by the Council of Safety at Charlestown of their supplying the Enemies with Rice, etc.”\textsuperscript{70}

As the state’s new executive and leader of the Gwinnett Party, Gov. Treutlen was shocked by the “Treachorous Conduct of Mr. Geo. McIntosh.” He tried sending George to the Continental Congress as a prisoner under armed guard for a hearing into his conduct. The Assembly cooperated and passed a proclamation on June 5 to revoke George’s bail over objections that Georgia’s new constitution called for him to be tried in his home county.\textsuperscript{71} Unfortunately for Treutlen, he tried to use officers from the Georgia Continental battalions for the escort job. Gen. McIntosh frustrated his efforts by having the officers involved put under arrest until George could slip away. Greatly irritated by the general’s interference, Gov. Treutlen called his actions “such a stretch of military Power” that Congress would undoubtedly take action against Lachlan. In fact, Treutlen openly blamed the general’s refusal to submit to civilian control for the “Duel that
deprived this State of the Life of Mr. Gwinnett, whose loss at this time will be severely felt.”

For his part, George McIntosh responded on the 16th. He appeared before the “Governor and Council, where he used every possible argument, to no purpose, to have his trial in Georgia, and endeavored to show, in every point of view, the violation offered to that Constitution, they were sworn to maintain.” He pointed to plain language in the Georgia Constitution giving him the right to be tried in Georgia and the very obvious violation of the separation of powers doctrine. The judiciary of Georgia should be hearing his case and deciding issues of bail and confiscation, he argued. His appearance had some positive effect and they voted to grant George three weeks for the purpose of getting additional evidence for his defense.

The following day, Gov. Treutlen and the Council met secretly for several hours before sending a summons to George demanding his appearance on the morning of the 20th. The suddenness of the summons and the secret proceedings he previously observed alerted George McIntosh that his three weeks’ grace period would not be honored. Beyond that “he not only expected ill usage, perhaps to be carried in irons, but apprehended there might be some danger of his life.” Not unexpectedly, George McIntosh went into hiding and skipped his appearance on the morning of the 20th.

While factional politics raged in Savannah, the expedition to East Florida hardly progressed at all. The merchant Joseph Clay observed that the venture was undertaken “with more zeal than prudence.” He felt it clear that Georgia was incapable of more than defending itself against the British raids. Col. Elbert’s experience following the removal of McIntosh was not really different from Clay’s observation. Once the general had been removed, Gen. Howe recalled some of the detachments of SC Continental artillery and infantry to Charlestown. Elbert tried to go on without them but was hopelessly outnumbered and under armed for an invasion against East Florida. The expedition floundered just across the Florida border and ended in retreat to Savannah by the middle of June.

Gov. Treutlen wasted no time in laying blame for the failure of Georgia’s expedition against East Florida at the feet of the McIntosh brothers. Less than a week following Elbert’s retreat, Treutlen complained to Congress that East Florida “would have been evacuated long before now, if they had not received Supplies of Rice & Cattle from this State & tis very obvious from what Persons they have received them.” He continued the tirade against both of the brothers, even to the extent of considering them Tories: “While the Command of the Continental Troops remains in the hands of the McIntoshes, our People will never think themselves safe, & even the Inhabitants of Florida will have nothing to fear from us: of this you will be particularly informed hereafter. The House of Assembly, sensible to the great difficulty of bringing any Tory to Justice in this State, arising from their numerous Connections, have thought it the best way to send Mr. McIntosh to the Congress, that his case may be there considered by Gentlemen, who cannot be biassed by any motives, & who will undoubtedly form an impartial & just Judgment of his Conduct.”

George McIntosh did not sit idly during his time hiding from the authorities. He completed putting together a number of witness statements in the form of affidavits to use as evidence in his trial. Assuming he could actually get a trial, George had affidavits from the ship’s master on his vessel, his business partners, his plantation overseer, and several others with knowledge of the rice trade. He wrote a narrative (and legal brief) to go with the evidence and published all of it together in a pamphlet he titled, The Case of George McIntosh.

In addition to the legal arguments, George’s publication provides a more detailed account of his rice sales and of his venture with Alexander Baillie, William Panton, and Patrick [George’s brother-in-law Sir Patrick, II] Houstoun. The original ship was loaded at Sunbury by McIntosh, Baillie, and Houstoun. McIntosh gave instructions to James Johnston (the ship’s master) for the Betsy and Nancy not to stray from its authorized course and to sell the cargo to some merchants in Surinam. After the brig sailed from Sunbury down the coast, William and Thomas Panton came aboard along with some additional barrels of rice. They sailed south at which time William Panton instructed Master Johnston to “make for the St. John’s river in
East-Florida.” Once in British waters, the brig was boarded by a Loyalist leader named Osborne which caused Thomas Panton to destroy their clearance papers from Georgia. Panton then traveled overland to St. Augustine and used his Tory connections to secure new clearance documents allowing passage to the West Indies. After some five weeks’ delay, the Betsy and Nancy sailed to Jamaica where Panton sold the cargo for rum, sugar, and coffee. The brig sailed back to St. Augustine, arriving on January 6, 1777. The brig never sold or offloaded any rice in St. Augustine and George McIntosh had been completely unaware and innocent of any commercial transactions with the enemy.  

Naturally the members of the Liberty Society (Gwinnett Party) remained unconvinced. They wrote and published a response to The Case of George McIntosh which attempted to refute George’s arguments regarding the case. The new pamphlet was called Strictures on a pamphlet entitled, the Case of George McIntosh, esquire. It contained a defense of Gwinnett’s actions in having arrested McIntosh and held him in irons along with their own actions in revoking George’s bail and ordering him to Philadelphia as a prisoner under escort. They expressed outrage at George’s pamphlet, calling it an “attempt to justify the flight” of McIntosh from the government and an “artful and foul lure to divide the real friends of freedom in this state.” They did not actually make any convincing legal arguments regarding the lack of due process provided to George McIntosh in Georgia but, instead, justified the revocation of his bail by declaring the previous actions by the executive council to be “gross errors” and without “regard for the safety of the liberties of America.” Well aware they had bypassed the state’s judiciary, the assembly believed the McIntosh Party would simply prevent any honest decision. They resolved to send George to Philadelphia for the Continental Congress to judge. However, they wanted it understood that “the falsehoods and deceptions, set forth in vindication of George McIntosh, if even a mind could be found, sufficiently weak, to receive any impression from them, are as foreign to the real case of George McIntosh, Esq., as that man’s house on Sappelo [Island] is distant from Savannah.” Unfortunately for the Liberty Society, their pamphlet was based solely on the Tonyn letter and did not really contain any additional evidence. Overall, the Strictures tried to play on outrage and only emphasized the political nature of the dispute in Georgia.

While the Liberty Society drafted their response, George McIntosh prepared to emerge from hiding and travel to Philadelphia. He desperately wanted to avoid the spectacle of being hauled across the colonies as a prisoner in irons but still needed to appear in Philadelphia to clear his name of the charges. George sent word to the governor “that I am on my way to Philadelphia, in order to surrender myself to the Honourable, the Continental Congress.” hoping his voluntary departure would pacify the assembly, George included an appeal that his property “not be wantonly wasted or destroyed before I am convicted of any crime.” He left JohnWereat and Lachlan McIntosh as his attorneys to take possession and protect the estate in return for bond of twice the value of property returned. George complained that his plantation and crops had already been plundered and his slaves taken away, and “I am told even whipping one of them to death.” The excuse given for plundering his estate was an unfounded rumor that McIntosh had slipped away to Florida to join the British.  

Treutlen and the Council initially approved the bond. However, when Wereat and Lachlan McIntosh discovered the slaves in possession of one William Knox and obtained a warrant to search his plantation, the Council reversed course and ordered that “the negroes belonging to George McIntosh, and which was ordered to be seized by an order from this Board, be sent up to the plantation of Mr. William Knox, until the further orders of this Board.” Unable to save any of his brother’s estate, Lachlan McIntosh also found himself more and more under attack from the Liberty Society. They circulated secret letters that equated Lachlan’s resistance to Gwinnett and Treutlen as an attempt to “subvert & oppose” the civil authority of Georgia. Indeed, they asserted that Lachlan’s behavior would have “most dangerous consequences & tend to the Introduction of Anarchy & every evil work.” These secret letters branded the general as “a dangerous person whose going at large may be highly prejudicial to the
publick welfare” and called for petitions requesting “removal of the said General McKintosh, & praying that the same may be done as soon as possible.”

Lachlan and John Wereat responded with another publication of their own. Called simply, An Addition to the Case of George M’Intosh, Esquire, the pair provided updates to Congress concerning the lack of due process allowed for George McIntosh and his estate. They made some very strong legal arguments concerning George McIntosh’s civil rights and the acts of the Georgia Assembly against him. The pamphlet concluded that “No man, after this, can pretend to say that law, justice or equity have any existence in the State of Georgia; but that cruelty, tyranny, and oppression; are established upon their ruin.”

The Liberty Society fired right back with a series of very pitiful letters from Ann Gwinnett to Pres. John Hancock and the Continental Congress. She had nothing particularly relevant to say from a legal standpoint but she did provide an emotional aspect casting both McIntosh brothers as Tories with rice dealings with the enemy. Quite naturally, given her position as grieving widow, Ann Gwinnett directed her anger more at Lachlan McIntosh than George McIntosh. After all, “the want of a good General makes bad work, prevented Augustine from being taken, & makes Georgia bad off now indeed.”

The widow Gwinnett went on to provide an account of the duel itself in which Button “had good reason to apprehend the General was far from being a real friend to the cause of the United States.” She then fingered Joseph Habersham and George Wells as the seconds in the duel who were “so cruel & Bloodthirsty” they measured the dueling distance to be only 10 feet. Before the communication concluded, Mrs. Gwinnett had labeled all the political supporters of the McIntosh Party as Loyalists. After all, “none but Tories would Bail a State Prisoner, & one that had been in the Council too ---- but tis plain He only got in to betray it ---- really they are all so much alike they will all bail one another, take any oath, do anything to put the Continental Money in their pocket, & do nothing for it but Sacrifice the State & any Person in it that is true to it, in it.”

As a repeated theme in her lengthy letter to Hancock, Mrs. Gwinnett returned to her rant against Lachlan McIntosh. “Oh He proves a very Traitor, it would fill Volumes to relate his trecherous Villany. His Brothers & His own chicanery shine in Georgia--His Eldest Brother William behaved so ill last year it brought Him to a tryal, but the Artifice of the General & His good friends the tories brought him off clear. I cannot help wishing to live to see the day when no McIntosh is in pay here.” The widow presented no legal argument against George McIntosh but, when it came later to analyzing the behavior of Lachlan McIntosh, the letter itself stood as further evidence that Lachlan was hopelessly locked in the middle of a dispute that was polarizing the state. The secret letter earlier circulated by the Liberty Society also resulted in petitions from citizens in Chatham County and the Georgia Assembly requesting the removal of Gen. Lachlan McIntosh from “this state, which we are firmly persuaded is a step absolutely necessary for the immediate Safety of the same.”

The political battle continued into September. George McIntosh finally arrived in Philadelphia but found a smallpox outbreak in the area had forced Congress to move to Lancaster, Pennsylvania. Consistent with his still weakened condition from the piles, dysentery, and fevers that plagued him earlier in the year, George promptly came down with smallpox.

The delay caused by George’s need for recovery prior to trial provided time for the McIntosh Party to make two final significant political moves in their feud with the Liberty Society. First, John Wereat contacted George Walton and other friendly members of the Continental Congress to make certain they knew the arguments in favor of the brothers. He very effectively cast the charges against Lachlan McIntosh as nothing but guilt by association.

The last significant political move prior to the hearings in the Continental Congress may have been the publishing of John Wereat’s Remarks on a pamphlet, entitled, “Strictures on a pamphlet, entitled the Case of George M’Intosh, Esq. Published by order of the Liberty Society.” A complete brief in response to the Liberty Society’s
pamphlet, Wereat’s work also served as an indictment of the Liberty Society itself. He began by accusing them of “artfully endeavoring to make the people believe that George McIntosh has fled from justice, which they know to be” far from the truth. “These sons of darkness, determined at all events to destroy this gentleman and to divide his inheritance, industriously reported for a while, that he was gone to St. Augustine, in order to enrage the people, and give a plausible pretence for seizing and destroying his property.”

Among the more interesting points made in Wereat’s pamphlet was the story of rice sales to St. Augustine in the summer of 1776 when George McIntosh was accused of trading with the British in East Florida. He gave details of the Council routinely licensing ships traveling south with knowledge of illicit trade. In fact, the State of Georgia itself participated in rice sales to St. Augustine amounting to ten times the quantity carried by the McIntosh vessel. Wereat fell just short of accusing the Council of treason. “I do not mean here like our authors (Liberty Society) to insinuate that the Council and Convention were privy to the designs of [merchants] Kelsall and Moore; but this I will be bold to affirm, that the Council were more to blame for trusting one partner with two thousand four hundred pounds sterling worth of the public property, than George McIntosh was in trusting the other with sixty barrels of his own rice, worth at that time about ninety pounds.”

The Remarks were very well written and covered most of the necessary arguments for George McIntosh’s defense. The letter from Royal Gov. Tonyn was not admissible evidence, George had no knowledge of his ship trading with the British, the Council of Georgia had trampled on George’s rights, and the ship in question did not sell rice in St. Augustine, anyway. The pamphlet ended with a history of the Liberty Society to include a good bit of biography on its leaders. “This nocturnal Cabal was first contrived by the late President of Georgia near two years ago, with a manifest intention to set one part of the province at variance and enmity with the other.” Wereat went on to describe how Gwinnett’s military ambitions had poisoned the relationship with the military, “by his influence and weight at the nightly meetings, he without one military qualification, found an interest sufficient to get himself appointed Colonel of the battalion in opposition to Colonel Elbert.” Gwinnett later had to resign in order to serve in the Continental Congress but then continued to seek command of the state’s military afterwards, and, of course the feud was on.

Congress finally heard the case in October. The charges and letters from Anne Gwinnett were read on the 1st before a special committee of three southerners who would review them in detail. A couple of days later a friend of the McIntosh brothers, George Walton, moved to have copies of the charges and evidence against him provided to George McIntosh so he might prepare a defense. The motion failed and, along with it, the special committee was discharged. This forced the entire issue back into the general Congress.

A few days later, Congress tried again to dispose of the issue by committee. This time, instead of using a panel from the southern states, the three appointees were John Adams (Mass.), James Duane (NY), and William Williams (Conn.). Quite likely due to John Adams’s ability to distinguish legal issues of the case from the biased rhetoric, the panel took only one day to come back with a recommendation that George McIntosh be immediately released for lack of evidence sufficient to detain him. The case of George McIntosh ended.

The case of Lachlan McIntosh was actually easier to dispose of in that no case existed. In the heat of the dispute, Gen. Robert Howe sent a letter to George Washington asking him to find a place for Gen. McIntosh. With McIntosh being highly recommended by George Walton, Gen. Washington agreed to take on Lachlan. Gen. McIntosh then spent the winter at Valley Forge before being assigned a command on the western frontier fighting Indians. Unfortunately, his time there did not go well. By the end of 1778, his entire command turned on him. The leader of this minor insurrection declared to Washington that “there is not an officer who does not appear to be exceedingly disgusted and I am much deceived if they serve under his immediate Command another Campaign.”

Washington responded by pointing out that a "general assertion and opinion with regard to the
dissatisfaction of his officers is by no means a foundation” to censure or remove an officer. However, that being said, within a short time, Gen. McIntosh returned to Georgia and his former duties as a brigadier in the Southern Department. He served less than a year before Gen. Benjamin Lincoln and the entire command surrendered to Gen. Sir Henry Clinton at Charleston. Following the surrender, though on parole, the British sent McIntosh to St. Augustine along with a number of other rebel leaders considered troublemakers. There they remained until exchanged in June of 1781.

As to George McIntosh, he never really returned to a good state of health and died in December 1779. His plantations and property remained in the same ruinous state as his reputation. There seemed a general agreement that George should have realized his rice was going to British ports and not trusted known Loyalists with his cargo. Even though he assisted in getting George out from under the charges, Henry Laurens later observed that George “gave way to temptation and to say lastly, acted very indiscretely. He seems to have been in the class of those who wished the American cause very well but not so well as to make any sacrifice of his investment.”

Conclusion

From the onset of the Revolution, Button Gwinnett ranked among the most ardent advocates of independence. In addition to national independence, Gwinnett also worked for expanded liberty and voting rights in Georgia. He enjoyed great popularity and should have been all set for a grand career as a state political leader. Unfortunately, Gwinnett could not shake his ambition to command the military. Even though his efforts clearly demonstrate a lack of experience and knowledge concerning military matters, Gwinnett persisted in his desire for command not only to his own destruction but to the great detriment of his state. His waste of manpower and feud with the very family who might have had the experience and knowledge necessary to defend the southern frontier caused the collapse of all defenses and kept the political situation in a continual state of partisanship.

As for Lachlan McIntosh, he comes away at first as a hero stepping in as a neutral party to take command of the regiment and protect the state. Lachlan and his brothers were loyal Whigs who, unfortunately for them, stood in the path of Gwinnett’s lofty ambitions. Perhaps it was their Scottish roots at play but the McIntosh brothers decided to stand firm. Even after William had been exonerated by the court martial, George McIntosh infuriated Gwinnett with his refusal to sign the petition granting the newly appointed President of the Council of Safety expanded war powers. Gwinnett went after George with a fury while Lachlan continued in his position as brigadier general in charge of the State’s Continental troops. During Gwinnett’s poorly-planned attempt to invade East Florida, Gen. McIntosh provided what can only be described as passive resistance. Instead of becoming proactive as a military commander trying to assist his Commander in Chief, Lachlan sat idle on the frontier waiting for Gwinnett to join him. His efforts to resist Gwinnett’s command became close to silliness when continued arguments broke out over who would host the officers’ meetings necessary to plan the invasion.

And then the two men met on a field of honor, with a result almost nobody felt had any honor. After his election loss, Gwinnett had been quick to take offense at McIntosh’s insult. For his part, McIntosh should have cooled long before and realized his attempt to have Gwinnett censured would have no impact. Instead, Gen. McIntosh insisted and pushed. And, as shown above, the resulting duel not only killed Gwinnett but also led to a serious stain on the reputation and memory of Lachlan McIntosh. Not to mention the collateral damage of George McIntosh’s total destruction. To make matters worse, the political situation in Georgia never really recovered and, when the British arrived in 1778, the state remained without significant organized defenses. Extreme partisanship fostered by Gwinnett’s military ambitions and exasperated by McIntosh’s reaction had left Georgia open to invasion and occupation. It would be the only state that experienced a return of Crown government during the war.
1 D. J. Drewien, *Button Gwinnett* (Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania: RoseDog Books, 2007) - general information taken from chapter one while the education quote is actually attributed to: John Vinci, *Biography of Button Gwinnett*, http://colonialhall.com/gwinnett/gwinnett.php The Stamp Act (1765) was one of eleven other acts of the English Parliament designed to raise taxes to help relieve the huge debt of the English Crown remaining after the Seven Years War and then to reign in their rebellious North American colonies.

2 Ibid., 27 - 43

3 Ibid., 46-50

4 Remarks on a pamphlet, entitled, “Strictures on a pamphlet, entitled the Case of George M’Intosh, Esq. Published by order of the Liberty Society”, Published in 1777, 15


6 McIntosh to Walton, 11 July 1776, The Papers of Lachlan McIntosh, Lilla Hawes, editor (Athens, Ga.: Ga. Historical Society, 1979), 8

7 Harvey H. Jackson, *Lachlan McIntosh and the Politics of Revolutionary Georgia*, (Athens, Ga.: University of Georgia Press, 1979), 52


9 Jackson, *Lachlan McIntosh and the Politics of Revolutionary Georgia*, 1 - 10

10 Ibid.

11 Ibid. Ft. Frederica, on St. Simons Island, Ga., is now a National Monument.

12 Darien Committee Resolution of 12 January 1775, Allen Candler, editor, *The Revolutionary Records of the State of Georgia, Volume I*, (Atlanta: Franklin Turner Company, 1908), 39 - interestingly enough, the same resolution also purported to ban slavery in the colony and pledged the signers to work toward manumission of all slaves.


14 M’Intosh to Washington, 8 March 1776, Papers of Lachlan McIntosh, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah: Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 2-3. This important American victory, often called the Battle of the Rice Boats or Hutchinson’s Island, played out in the Savannah River opposite of the City of Savannah in early March 1776. It occurred before the Declaration of Independence and insured continued Whig control of Georgia until December 1778.

15 M’Intosh to George Walton, 11 July 1776, Ibid., 8.

16 M’Intosh to Gwinnett, 1 May 1776, ibid at 5 - 6 and also see: M’Intosh to Walton, 11 July 1776, ibid at 9


21 Ibid.


29 M’Intosh to Elbert, 7 January 1777 and 8 January 1777, *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah: Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 34


33 Minutes of the Constitutional Convention, January 24 to February 5, 1777, reprinted in Charles Francis Jenkins, *Button Gwinnett*, (New York: Double Day, Page & Company, 1926), 109. This new State Constitution, approved in February 1777, titled the new state’s chief executive officer as “governor”.

34 Remarks on a pamphlet, entitled, “Strictures on a pamphlet, entitled the Case of George M’Intosh, Esq. Published by order of the Liberty Society.”, 1777, 4
36 Ibid at 123
37 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
41 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
44 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
45 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
47 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
50 George M’Intosh, *The Humble Memorial and Petition of George McIntosh Esquire of Georgia*, 8 October 1777, (Journal of the Continental Congress)
54 Papers respecting the Augustine Expedition in April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Georgia Historical Society, 1957), p. 61
57 M’Intosh to Howe, 2 April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 45
58 M’Intosh to Gwinnett, 11 April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 45
59 Papers respecting the Augustine Expedition in April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 61
60 Papers respecting the Augustine Expedition in April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 62
61 Papers respecting the Augustine Expedition in April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 62
64 M’Intosh to Elbert, 28 April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 48
65 Allen D. Candler, *The Revolutionary Records of the State of Georgia VI.* (Atlanta, The Franklin-Turner Company, 1908), 306. Treutlen was an Ebenezer and two Sisters Ferry planter and merchant. He was also the colonel of the Effingham County Georgia militia regiment.
66 Papers respecting the Augustine Expedition in April 1777, reprinted in *The Papers of Lachlan M’Intosh*, Lilla Hawes, (Savannah, Ga. Historical Society, 1957), 62
67 Lyman Hall to Roger Sherman, 1 June 1777, reprinted in; Charles Francis Jenkins, *Button Gwinnett*, (New York: Double Day, Page & Company, 1926), 229
69 Lyman Hall to Roger Sherman, 1 June 1777, reprinted in; Charles Francis Jenkins, *Button Gwinnett*, (New York: Double Day, Page & Company, 1926), 229
70 Governor John Adam Treutlen to John Hancock, 19 June 1777, reprinted in; Charles Francis Jenkins, *Button Gwinnett*, (New York: Double Day, Page & Company, 1926), 244
71 Lachlan McIntosh, *A.D. Addition to the Case of George McIntosh, Esquire*, (Savannah?, 1777), 4
Wayne Lynch is an independent researcher and frequent writer on the American Revolution in the South, published in the on-line *Journal of the American Revolution*. Since 2010, he has been researching and writing a book about the Southern Campaigns of the American Revolution. With several ancestors who were active on both sides of Revolutionary fighting in the south, Wayne has enjoyed a lifelong attachment to American history with a specialization on the American Revolution. He is a certified public accountant and tax attorney in Galveston, Texas.